

MARINE STEWARDSHIP COUNCIL – TECHNICAL ADVISORY BOARD

TAB DIRECTIVE SERIES

TAB Directive number	Title	Date
TAB D-006	Scoring of P1, C2 and P2, C3 in assessment tree hierarchies	TAB meetings 2004 MSC release February 2005

Background

Through analysis and examination by the TAB for consistency of assessment trees, performance indicators and scoring guideposts, an issue has come to light regarding the treatment of Principle 1, Criterion 2 and Principle 2, Criterion 3. These criteria deal with depleted populations and recovery. The inconsistency of approach by certification bodies relates to when a fish stock or ecologically related species are not depleted and therefore have no need to be in recovery.

Certification bodies were using different approaches. One approach included performance indicators and scoring guideposts in assessment trees and scored them regardless of whether target stocks or ecologically related species were depleted. Another approach included performance indicators and scoring guideposts in assessment trees, but when depletion was not relevant, they were removed from the models and not scored.

Directive

The TAB directs that P1, C2 and / or P2, C3 shall only be scored and weighted if a fishery or it's ecologically related species are depleted. The possibility for depletion shall be built into the assessment hierarchy in the draft and final assessment trees, but once determining that a fishery or it's ecologically related species are not depleted, the indicators should not be scored or weighted. In fact, these criteria (performance indicators and scoring guideposts) should be removed from the model.

The MSC guidance document *"Using AHP and Expert Choice to support the MSC Accreditation process"*, section 5.2, recommends that if a criterion is not appropriate it should be removed from the model". (Model means the assessment tree entered into Expert Choice)

Scoring and weighting of future recovery plans (in the case of non-depletion) are more appropriately scored under Principle 3A, Criterion 10, Sub-criterion (a) for ecologically related species and (c) for depleted stock:

"Specify measures and strategies that demonstrably control the degree of exploitation of the resource, including but not limited to.....

(a) setting catch levels that will maintain the target population and ecological community's high productivity relative to its potential productivity, and account for the non-target species (or size, age, sex) captured and landed in association with, or as a consequence of, fishing for target species;

(c) providing for the recovery and rebuilding of depleted fish populations to specified levels within specified time limits."

ENDS